



**Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI);  
Signature Policies;  
Part 4: Signature applicability rules (validation policy)  
for European qualified electronic signatures/seals  
using trusted lists**

[https://standards.etsi.org/ETSI/ETSI%20TS%20119-172-4%20V1.1.1%20\(2021-05\)/](https://standards.etsi.org/ETSI/ETSI%20TS%20119-172-4%20V1.1.1%20(2021-05)/)  
926eb46aa1ef/etsi-ts-119-172-4-v1-1-1-2021-05

---

**Reference**

DTS/ESI-0019172-4

---

**Keywords**

e-commerce, electronic signature, trust services

**ETSI**

650 Route des Lucioles  
F-06921 Sophia Antipolis Cedex - FRANCE

Tel.: +33 4 92 94 42 00 Fax: +33 4 93 65 47 16

Siret N° 348 623 562 00017 - APE 7112B  
Association à but non lucratif enregistrée à la  
Sous-Préfecture de Grasse (06) N° w061004871

---

**Important notice**

The present document can be downloaded from:

<http://www.etsi.org/standards-search>

The present document may be made available in electronic versions and/or in print. The content of any electronic and/or print versions of the present document shall not be modified without the prior written authorization of ETSI. In case of any existing or perceived difference in contents between such versions and/or in print, the prevailing version of an ETSI deliverable is the one made publicly available in PDF format at [www.etsi.org/deliver](http://www.etsi.org/deliver).

Users of the present document should be aware that the document may be subject to revision or change of status.

Information on the current status of this and other ETSI documents is available at

<https://portal.etsi.org/TB/ETSIDeliverableStatus.aspx>

If you find errors in the present document, please send your comment to one of the following services:

<https://portal.etsi.org/People/CommitteeSupportStaff.aspx>

---

**Notice of disclaimer & limitation of liability**

The information provided in the present deliverable is directed solely to professionals who have the appropriate degree of experience to understand and interpret its content in accordance with generally accepted engineering or other professional standard and applicable regulations.

No recommendation as to products and services or vendors is made or should be implied.

No representation or warranty is made that this deliverable is technically accurate or sufficient or conforms to any law and/or governmental rule and/or regulation and further, no representation or warranty is made of merchantability or fitness for any particular purpose or against infringement of intellectual property rights.

In no event shall ETSI be held liable for loss of profits or any other incidental or consequential damages.

Any software contained in this deliverable is provided "AS IS" with no warranties, express or implied, including but not limited to, the warranties of merchantability, fitness for a particular purpose and non-infringement of intellectual property rights and ETSI shall not be held liable in any event for any damages whatsoever (including, without limitation, damages for loss of profits, business interruption, loss of information, or any other pecuniary loss) arising out of or related to the use of or inability to use the software.

---

**Copyright Notification**

No part may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and microfilm except as authorized by written permission of ETSI.

The content of the PDF version shall not be modified without the written authorization of ETSI.

The copyright and the foregoing restriction extend to reproduction in all media.

© ETSI 2021.  
All rights reserved.

# Contents

Intellectual Property Rights .....	4
Foreword.....	4
Modal verbs terminology.....	4
Introduction .....	4
1 Scope .....	6
2 References .....	6
2.1 Normative references .....	6
2.2 Informative references.....	7
3 Definition of terms, symbols, abbreviations and notations .....	7
3.1 Terms.....	7
3.2 Symbols.....	7
3.3 Abbreviations .....	8
3.4 Notations .....	8
4 Signature applicability rules for the validation of EU qualified electronic signatures/seals .....	8
4.1 Introduction .....	8
4.2 Validation constraints and validation procedures.....	8
4.3 Requirements on signature validation and applicability rules checking practices.....	10
4.4 Technical applicability (rules) checking process.....	10
4.4.1 Overview .....	10
4.4.2 Processing .....	10
4.5 Requirements on applicability rules checking report.....	12
<b>Annex A (normative):</b> <b>OIDs .....</b>	<b>14</b>
History .....	15

iTech STANDARD PREVIEW  
(standards.iteh.ai)

[ETSI TS 119 172-4 V1.1.1 \(2021-05\)](https://standards.iteh.ai/catalog/standards/sist/b30e2f66-2915-4cc6-8176-926eb46aa1ef/etsi-ts-119-172-4-v1-1-1-2021-05)

<https://standards.iteh.ai/catalog/standards/sist/b30e2f66-2915-4cc6-8176-926eb46aa1ef/etsi-ts-119-172-4-v1-1-1-2021-05>

---

# Intellectual Property Rights

## Essential patents

IPRs essential or potentially essential to normative deliverables may have been declared to ETSI. The declarations pertaining to these essential IPRs, if any, are publicly available for **ETSI members and non-members**, and can be found in ETSI SR 000 314: "*Intellectual Property Rights (IPRs); Essential, or potentially Essential, IPRs notified to ETSI in respect of ETSI standards*", which is available from the ETSI Secretariat. Latest updates are available on the ETSI Web server (<https://ipr.etsi.org/>).

Pursuant to the ETSI Directives including the ETSI IPR Policy, no investigation regarding the essentiality of IPRs, including IPR searches, has been carried out by ETSI. No guarantee can be given as to the existence of other IPRs not referenced in ETSI SR 000 314 (or the updates on the ETSI Web server) which are, or may be, or may become, essential to the present document.

## Trademarks

The present document may include trademarks and/or tradenames which are asserted and/or registered by their owners. ETSI claims no ownership of these except for any which are indicated as being the property of ETSI, and conveys no right to use or reproduce any trademark and/or tradename. Mention of those trademarks in the present document does not constitute an endorsement by ETSI of products, services or organizations associated with those trademarks.

**DECT™**, **PLUGTESTS™**, **UMTS™** and the ETSI logo are trademarks of ETSI registered for the benefit of its Members. **3GPP™** and **LTE™** are trademarks of ETSI registered for the benefit of its Members and of the 3GPP Organizational Partners. **oneM2M™** logo is a trademark of ETSI registered for the benefit of its Members and of the oneM2M Partners. **GSM®** and the GSM logo are trademarks registered and owned by the GSM Association.

ITEH STANDARD PREVIEW  
(standards.iteh.ai)

---

# Foreword

This Technical Specification (TS) has been produced by ETSI Technical Committee Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI).

ETSI TS 119 172-4 V1.1.1 (2021-05)

<https://standards.iteh.ai/catalog/standards/sist/926eb46a-1ef-etsi-ts-119-172-4-v1-1-1-2021-05>

The present document is part 4 of a multi-part deliverable. Full details of the entire series can be found in part 1 [3].

---

# Modal verbs terminology

In the present document "**shall**", "**shall not**", "**should**", "**should not**", "**may**", "**need not**", "**will**", "**will not**", "**can**" and "**cannot**" are to be interpreted as described in clause 3.2 of the [ETSI Drafting Rules](#) (Verbal forms for the expression of provisions).

"**must**" and "**must not**" are **NOT** allowed in ETSI deliverables except when used in direct citation.

---

# Introduction

A digital signature is always used in a context, either implicit or explicit, e.g. as part of a business process.

Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 [i.1] defines the terms electronic signature, advanced electronic signature, qualified electronic signature, electronic seal, advanced electronic seal and qualified electronic seal. These electronic signatures and seals can be created using digital signature technology.

NOTE 1: When not stated otherwise in the present document, "signature" denotes "digital signature".

The purpose of signature applicability rules is to describe the requirements imposed on or committing the involved actors (signers, verifiers, relying parties and/or potentially one or more trust service providers) with respect to the applicability of signatures to documents and data that are signed in a particular context, transaction, process, business or application domain, in order to determine whether these signatures are fit for a particular business or legal purpose.

NOTE 2: The terms "signature applicability rules" are known as "signature validation policy" in ETSI TS 119 172-1 [3] while they are being used in other standards like ETSI TS 119 102-1 [1], ETSI TS 119 441 [i.9] to identify the "*set of rules, applicable to one or more digital signatures, that defines the requirements for their determination of whether a signature is fit for a particular business or legal purpose*". The terms "signature validation policy" is used in these latter documents to refer to a very specific set of technical constraints to technically validate a digital signature. Signature applicability rules can include more rules than those applying to those technical signature validation constraints. ETSI TS 119 172-1 [3] can be used to define such signature applicability rules.

EXAMPLE: An example of such applicability is the determination whether a digital signature can be determined as an EU qualified electronic signature or seal in accordance with (EU) No 910/2014 [i.1], in particular with its Article 32 on "Requirements for the validation of qualified electronic signatures" where the term validation is understood in the common sense. In this context the "applicability rules" adds, to the technical validation of the signature, verification that the signer certificate has been issued as an EU qualified certificate for electronic signature/seal, that it was a valid qualified certificate at the time of signing, that the signature creation data resides in a qualified electronic signature/seal creation device, etc.

There needs to be some way of expressing the rules for the technical validation of digital signatures and the determination of their applicability to the specific context of Article 32 of the eIDAS Regulation, i.e. to determine whether they can be (technically) considered as European qualified electronic signatures/seals using trusted lists (TLs) in the sense of the applicable European legislation at the time of signing, i.e. either Directive 1999/93/EC [i.2] or Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 [i.1].

The present document specifies such rules.

## iTeh STANDARD PREVIEW (standards.iteh.ai)

[ETSI TS 119 172-4 V1.1.1 \(2021-05\)](https://standards.iteh.ai/catalog/standards/sist/b30e2f66-29f5-4cc6-8176-926eb46aa1ef/etsi-ts-119-172-4-v1-1-1-2021-05)

<https://standards.iteh.ai/catalog/standards/sist/b30e2f66-29f5-4cc6-8176-926eb46aa1ef/etsi-ts-119-172-4-v1-1-1-2021-05>

---

# 1 Scope

The present document specifies a set of rules that aims at defining the technical requirements for determining, taking into account the EU Member States trusted lists [i.4], whether a digital signature is fit for meeting the requirements of EU qualified electronic signatures/seals in the sense of the applicable European legislation, i.e. either Directive 1999/93/EC [i.2] or Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 [i.1].

---

# 2 References

## 2.1 Normative references

References are either specific (identified by date of publication and/or edition number or version number) or non-specific. For specific references, only the cited version applies. For non-specific references, the latest version of the referenced document (including any amendments) applies.

Referenced documents which are not found to be publicly available in the expected location might be found at <https://docbox.etsi.org/Reference/>.

NOTE: While any hyperlinks included in this clause were valid at the time of publication, ETSI cannot guarantee their long term validity.

The following referenced documents are necessary for the application of the present document.

- [1] ETSI TS 119 102-1: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Procedures for Creation and Validation of AdES Digital Signatures; Part 1: Creation and Validation".
- [2] ETSI TS 119 612 (V2.1.1): "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Trusted Lists".
- [3] ETSI TS 119 172-1: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Signature Policies; Part 1: Building blocks and table of contents for human readable signature policy documents".
- [4] ETSI EN 319 122-1: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); CAAdES digital signatures; Part 1: Building blocks and CAAdES baseline signatures".
- [5] ETSI EN 319 132-1: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); XAdES digital signatures; Part 1: Building blocks and XAdES baseline signatures".
- [6] ETSI EN 319 142-1: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); PAdES digital signatures; Part 1: Building blocks and PAdES baseline signatures".
- [7] ETSI TS 103 171: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); XAdES Baseline Profile".
- [8] ETSI TS 103 172: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); PAdES Baseline Profile".
- [9] ETSI TS 103 173: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); CAAdES Baseline Profile".
- [10] ETSI TS 103 174: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); ASiC Baseline Profile".
- [11] IETF RFC 3161: "Internet X.509 Public Key Infrastructure Time-Stamp Protocol (TSP)".
- [12] ETSI TS 119 615: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Trusted lists; Procedures for using and interpreting European Union Member States national trusted lists".

## 2.2 Informative references

References are either specific (identified by date of publication and/or edition number or version number) or non-specific. For specific references, only the cited version applies. For non-specific references, the latest version of the reference document (including any amendments) applies.

NOTE: While any hyperlinks included in this clause were valid at the time of publication, ETSI cannot guarantee their long term validity.

The following referenced documents are not necessary for the application of the present document but they assist the user with regard to a particular subject area.

- [i.1] Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council on electronic identification and trust services for electronic transactions in the internal market and repealing Directive 1999/93/EC.
- [i.2] Directive 1999/93/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 December 1999 on a Community framework for electronic signatures.
- [i.3] ETSI TR 119 001: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); The framework for standardization of signatures; Definitions and abbreviations".
- [i.4] Commission Implementing Decision (EU) 2015/1505 of 8 September 2015 laying down technical specifications and formats relating to trusted lists pursuant to Article 22(5) of Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council on electronic identification and trust services for electronic transactions in the internal market.
- [i.5] Commission Implementing Decision (EU) 2015/1506 of 8 September 2015 laying down specifications relating to formats of advanced electronic signatures and advanced seals to be recognised by public sector bodies pursuant to Articles 27(5) and 37(5) of Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council on electronic identification and trust services for electronic transactions in the internal market.
- [i.6] ETSI TS 119 312: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Cryptographic Suites".
- [i.7] ETSI TS 119 101: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Policy and security requirements for applications for signature creation and signature validation".
- [i.8] ETSI TS 119 102-2: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Procedures for Creation and Validation of AdES Digital Signatures; Part 2: Signature Validation Report".
- [i.9] ETSI TS 119 441: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Policy requirements for TSP providing signature validation services".
- [i.10] ETSI TS 119 511: "Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Policy and security requirements for trust service providers providing long-term preservation of digital signatures or general data using digital signature techniques".

---

## 3 Definition of terms, symbols, abbreviations and notations

### 3.1 Terms

For the purposes of the present document, the terms given in ETSI TS 119 441 [i.9] apply.

### 3.2 Symbols

Void.

### 3.3 Abbreviations

For the purposes of the present document, the abbreviations given in ETSI TR 119 001 [i.3] and the following apply:

CRL	Certificate Revocation List
EU	European Union
EUMS	EU Member State
OCSP	Online Certificate Status Protocol
OID	Object IDentifier
QES	Qualified Electronic Signatures/seals
QSCD	Qualified Signature/seal Creation Device
TARC	Technical Applicability (Rules) Checking
TL	Trusted List

### 3.4 Notations

The requirements in the present document are identified as follows:

<REQ> - <the clause number> - <2-digit number - incremental>

The management of the requirement identifiers for subsequent editions of the present document is as follows:

- When a requirement is inserted at the end of a clause, the 2-digit number above is incremented to the next available digit.
- When a requirement is inserted between two existing requirements, capital letters appended to the previous requirement identifier are used to distinguish new requirements.
- The requirement identifier for deleted requirements are kept and completed with "VOID".
- The requirement identifier for modified requirement are kept void and the modified requirement is identified by capital letter(s) appended to the initial requirement number.

<https://standards.iteh.ai/catalog/standards/sist/b30e2f66-29f5-4cc6-8176-926eb46aa1ef/etsi-ts-119-172-4-v1-1-1-2021-05>

## 4 Signature applicability rules for the validation of EU qualified electronic signatures/seals

### 4.1 Introduction

The requirements defined by the present document are organised in terms of:

- Requirements on the validation constraints and validation procedures in the sense of ETSI TS 119 102-1 [1].
- Requirements on signature validation and applicability rules checking practices.
- Requirements on the process of checking technical applicability (rules).
- Requirements on reporting the results of the applicability rules checking.

### 4.2 Validation constraints and validation procedures

**REQ-4.2-01:** The driving application or the signature validation application shall follow the validation process, as specified in ETSI TS 119 102-1 [1], clause 5.1.2 and shall support the Validation process for Signatures providing Long Term Availability and Integrity of Validation Material.

**REQ-4.2-02:** The present document gives the minimum requirements for QES as in the Regulation:

- The validation service may use additional inputs or additional requirements.

- b) If additional inputs and/or requirements are used, they shall be clearly indicated in the applicability rules checking report.

**REQ-4.2-03:** The constraints to be used as input to the validation process referred to in REQ-4.2-01 shall be as follows:

#### X.509 validation constraints

- a) The SetOfTrustAnchors constraint defined in ETSI TS 119 172-1 [3], clause A.4.2.1, table A.2 rows (m)1.1 shall be set to the relevant information from the 'Service digital identity' field(s) from the `SI-Results` output of the procedure specified in clause 4.3 of ETSI TS 119 615 [12], considering as input:
- i) the signing certificate, as successfully identified as per the execution of clause 5.2.3 of ETSI TS 119 102-1 [1] as part of step 2 of clause 5.3.4 of [1];
  - ii) the value <http://uri.etsi.org/TrstSvc/Svctype/CA/QC> for the `TLS-St i` Service type identifier; and
  - iii) the `NotBeforeDate` value of the signing certificate for the `Date-time` indication.

NOTE 1: The use of the `NotBeforeDate` value of the signing certificate here above is expected to identify the date at which the certificate has been issued as a valid (qualified) certificate, even if technically it can have been created before that date.

NOTE 2: The validation of any time-stamp does not require that the corresponding trust anchor is defined as a time-stamping generation service within an EU Member State national TL. See also REQ-4.5-01.d.ii).

- b) Constraints defined in ETSI TS 119 172-1 [3], clause A.4.2.1, table A.2 rows (m)1.2 to (m)1.10 shall not be used.
- c) With regards to revocation constraints:
- i) The `RevocationCheckingConstraints` shall be set to "eitherCheck" as defined in ETSI TS 119 172-1 [3], clause A.4.2.1, table A.2 rows (m)2.1.
  - ii) The `RevocationFreshnessConstraints` defined in ETSI TS 119 172-1 [3], clause A.4.2.1, table A.2 rows (m)2.2 shall be used with a maximum value of 0, ensuring that the revocation information is only accepted if it has been issued after the best signature time.
  - iii) Constraint defined in ETSI TS 119 172-1 [3], clause A.4.2.1, table A.2 rows (m)2.3 and (m)3 shall not be used.

NOTE 3: ETSI standards and referenced IETF RFCs only support the concept of "certificate suspension without memory", meaning that when a certificate is suspended it is considered as having an indeterminate validity status (waiting for next status change to occur, if any), and once unsuspended it is considered as having been valid during the period for which it was previously suspended.

#### Cryptographic constraints

NOTE 4: Guidance on cryptographic algorithms validity can be found in ETSI TS 119 312 [i.6].

- d) The cryptographic verification process specified in ETSI TS 119 102-1 [1] shall enable the validation procedure to report the relying party with information related to cryptographic suites used to generate the signature being validated and potential security related issues against either national rules or ETSI TS 119 312 [i.6], indicating clearly which of the national rules or ETSI TS 119 312 [i.6] has been used to express potential security issues.
- e) When the signature validation application is not able to deal with a specific algorithm or cryptographic suite, it shall not invalidate the signature for that reason but lead to an INDETERMINATE result and raise a warning indicating the concerned cryptographic suite and the fact it is not supported.

#### Signature elements constraints

- f) Failure to comply with one of the signature formats identified in REQ-4.3-01 shall not result in invalidating the signature but in a warning indicating such a failure and the reasons for such a failure.

## 4.3 Requirements on signature validation and applicability rules checking practices

NOTE 1: The requirements of the present clause refer to the practices whose related statements are referred to ETSI TS 119 172-1 [3], clause A.2.

**REQ-4.3-01:** The signature validation application should support signature formats compliant with:

- a) ETSI TS 103 171 [7];
- b) ETSI TS 103 172 [8];
- c) ETSI TS 103 173 [9];
- d) ETSI TS 103 174 [10]; and
- e) ETSI standards on baseline profiles for CAdES digital signatures (ETSI EN 319 122-1 [4]), XAdES digital signatures (ETSI EN 319 132-1 [5]), and PAdES digital signatures (ETSI EN 319 142-1 [6]).

NOTE 2: This aims to support CID (EU) 2015/1506 [i.5].

**REQ-4.3-02:** Signature validation applications should be compliant with ETSI TS 119 101 [i.7].

**REQ-4.3-03:** When provided as a service, the validation and applicability rules checking processes should be provided in compliance with ETSI TS 119 441 [i.9].

**REQ-4.3-04:** Relying parties shall be provided with unambiguous information with regards to any security relevant issue identified by the signature validation and applicability rules checking processes.

**REQ-4.3-05:** Relying parties shall be provided with procedures and facilities to validate the signatures and obtain validation and applicability rules checking results data.

**REQ-4.3-06:** Relying parties shall be provided with procedures and facilities allowing them to identify the relevance of further actions to be taken when the preservation of signed data and associated signatures is required.

NOTE 3: Guidance on preservation of signed data and associated signatures can be found in ETSI TS 119 511 [i.10].

## 4.4 Technical applicability (rules) checking process

### 4.4.1 Overview

The present clause defines a process for implementing technical applicability (rules) checks aiming to facilitate the determination whether a digital signature can be considered technically suitable to implement EU qualified electronic signatures/seals using trusted lists in the sense of the applicable European legislation at the time of signing, i.e. either Directive 1999/93/EC [i.2] or Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 [i.1].

This process aims to support the "validation" process referred to in Article 32(1) of Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 [i.1].

The inputs of this process are the outputs of the process performed as specified in clause 4.2 of the present document and the main output is a status indicating the technical suitability of the digital signature to implement an EU qualified electronic signature or seal in the sense of Article 32 of Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 [i.1].

### 4.4.2 Processing

NOTE 1: The next two requirements aim to support the verification of point (a) of Article 32(1), respectively Article 40, of Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 [i.1].

**REQ-4.4.2-01:** The technical applicability (rules) checking (TARC) process shall perform the process specified in clause 4.4 of ETSI TS 119 615 [12], with CERT set to the signing certificate and Date-time set to the best signature time resulting from the process performed as specified in REQ-4.2-01.